# GRAND RAPIDS CITY COMMISSION MEETING TUESDAY, APRIL 29<sup>™</sup>, 2025

# PUBLIC HEARING TO CONSIDER THE GRAND RAPIDS CLIMATE ACTION & ADAPTATION PLAN (CAAP)



Transcript edited by Kat Hart (<u>khart@grcity.us</u>) City of Grand Rapids Office of Sustainability May 2025



# CAAP Public Hearing YouTube Guide

In case you missed it, you can <u>view a recording of the Public Hearing</u> for the Grand Rapids <u>Climate Action & Adaptation Plan</u> (CAAP) that was held during the City Commission meeting on Tuesday, April 29th, 2025. There were 37 community members who attended and shared their insight on climate action.

Click the links below for specific sections of the full City Commission Meeting:

- <u>CAAP overview presentation</u> by Chief Sustainability Officer Annabelle Wilkinson (**5 minutes**; starts at 1:50:45)
- Public Comment (1 hour & 15 minutes; starts at 1:56:40)
- Comments from City Leadership
  - o Mayor LaGrand (starts at 4:19:50)
  - o <u>Commissioner Ysasi</u> 2nd Ward (starts at 4:21:00)
  - o <u>Commissioner Perdue</u> 3rd Ward (starts at 4:22:27)
  - o <u>Commissioner Robbins</u> 1st Ward (starts at 4:23:22)
  - o <u>Commissioner Knight</u> 2nd Ward (starts at 4:24:15)
  - o <u>Commissioner Kilgore</u> 3rd Ward (starts at 4:25:17)
  - o <u>Commissioner Belchak</u> 1st Ward (starts at 4:27:45)
- Final discussion for May 13th Work Session (starts at 4:28:31)

You can watch broadcasted meetings on Comcast Channel 26, Facebook, and YouTube:

English YouTube: <u>@TheCityofGrandRapids</u> Spanish YouTube: <u>@grandrapidsprogramacionene8748</u>

For more information on how to watch City meetings you can visit:

grandrapidsmi.gov/Government/Video/Live-Stream

# **Overview Presentation**

# Annabelle Wilkinson | Grand Rapids Chief Sustainability Officer Email: awilkinson@grand-rapids.mi.us

On April 15th, I provided a larger overview of our Climate Action Adaptation Plan Final Draft. Today, I'm going to be providing a very brief look at that plan, and I would encourage anyone who wants additional information to review our April 15th presentation, as well as to review the plan in its full draft on our website.

So, providing just a little review for folks, our <u>Climate Action & Adaptation Plan</u> is a roadmap for how the community of Grand Rapids will reduce greenhouse gas emissions and prepare for the impacts of climate change. This plan was created in partnership with community stakeholders based on resident feedback, as well as data from the City's greenhouse gas emissions inventory and climate risk and vulnerability assessment to meet our community wide, science-based targets:

- 62.8% per-capita GHG reduction, community-wide, by 2030 from 2019 emissions\*
- 100% per capita greenhouse gas reduction by 2050

Now, the City of Grand Rapids is committed to working towards those goals, strategies and actions that are outlined within the plan to achieve the adopted, community wide, science-based targets. But this is a community wide plan, and we will need everyone in community to have buy-in and proceeding action in order to achieve these targets that we have here today that are considered our measures of success.

So, the City will act as a leader, modeling emissions reductions and our facilities and fleet, implementing actions that are under local control, advocating for legislative and regulatory changes that are necessary to actually achieve these goals that we have established, and also to work to move towards community, to discuss and collaborate innovative solutions to create community progress.

In total, we engaged over 1,600 people during this <u>Climate Action & Adaptation Plan</u> process- over the last two years. We also sourced from our Community Master Planning process engagement over 1,800 participants during their second round of engagement, where they held workshops on the topics of climate mitigation, adaptation and environmental justice.

<sup>\*2.5</sup> million metric tons of carbon dioxide equivalent (MTCO<sub>2</sub>e) were emitted in 2019 by the residents and employers of Grand Rapids, MI

The <u>Climate Action & Adaptation Plan</u> includes 54 strategies and actions that correspond directly with the <u>Community Master Plan</u> recommendations, and our engagement approach for the <u>Climate Action & Adaptation Plan</u> was focused on:

- Increasing community ownership
- Removing barriers to participation
- Working with our community-based organizations
- Marketing to residents in Neighborhoods of Focus who may feel those greater impacts of climate change.

We began with establishing those relationships with our community stakeholders like the C4 (<u>Community Collaboration on Climate Change</u>), as well as coordinating with our <u>Community Master Plan</u>. And then we entered into those three rounds of community engagement:

# First Round (Visioning):

We understood what community's vision and priorities were for this plan. We took that information with our Climate Advisory Teams to create chapters with strategies and actions.

# Second Round (Analysis):

We brought that back to community for analysis for our chapter feedback. We then took all that information and created it into a draft.

# Third Round (Plan Development):

Then we brought it back to community to understand: did we hear you correctly? What is missing? And that is what we have today for final consideration for the plan. So, the framework that we have here today is our vision: *Grand Rapids will be a resilient, low-carbon City that centers equity and climate solutions to ensure a safe and healthy community.* The chapters that were established from our GHG inventory as well as community's priorities are:

- Energy Systems (pg. 40)
- Residential Homes (pg. 52)
- Buildings And Industry (pg. 61)
- Transportation (pg. 70)
- Nature Based Solutions (pg. 77)
- Food Systems (pg. 85)

And the structure of this plan moves from those community-wide, science-based targets to *goals*. Those *goals* are based on our GHG inventory high impact analysis that identifies specific outcomes in those sectors. To achieve those targets, then we have *strategies:* major initiatives or services that must be completed in order to make progress towards those *goals*, as well as a number of *actions*, programs, activities,

projects that will push forward those *strategies*. And the themes you see throughout these *actions* are health, resilience, equity, economic prosperity, and collaboration.

There's a lot of information within this plan, but just generally for **energy systems**, we're focusing on reducing decarbonizing our electricity grid and increasing its resilience.

For **residential homes** we're working on increasing energy efficiency and increasing clean energy use, as well as increasing the resilience of housing

For **buildings and industry** that we are also working on reducing energy, increasing high performing and low to zero emission new construction buildings and reducing GHG from industrial processes

For **transportation** we are focusing on reducing single occupancy vehicle usage, increasing promotion for public, active and shared modes of transportation, and moving vehicles that are on the road to electric vehicles.

For **nature-based solutions** we are focusing on achieving our tree canopy goal, ensuring that both people and the natural environment are healthy and resilient to the impacts of climate change.

For **food systems** we are reducing waste-related emissions from food scraps (methane from landfills), reducing solid waste, encouraging sustainable consumption, and improving the health and resilience of the food system.

Our next steps in this process would be potential consideration for adoption on May 13<sup>th</sup> [2025], and adoption would commit the City to evaluating this <u>Climate Action</u> <u>Adaptation Plan</u> every five years, in tandem with the new GHG inventory. And then we would move into implementation and prioritization:

- Understanding the GHG reduction potential of [the 198 CAAP] actions
- Funding
- Prioritizing strategies and actions

Thank you.

- Creating a timeline
- Identifying responsible parties
- Creating an online accountability hub for transparency.

# **Public Hearing for CAAP**

#### Arturo Puckerin, Works in Grand Rapids

So, my name is Arturo Puckerin. I am the Executive Director of the Community Collaboration on Climate Change, that's C4, and I want to start off just by saying that to address climate changes- climate *challenges*- effectively here in West Michigan, there's a critical need for climate justice, advocacy, for policy reform efforts, and for community initiatives aimed at reducing greenhouse gas emissions, like the City of Grand Rapids first Climate Action & Adaptation Plan; which is really the encompassing of action and adaptation. Because before us, it outlines a comprehensive and effective strategy to reduce greenhouse gas emissions- something that we've been working on for quite some time. Something that helps us transition to renewable energy sources, and of course, to invest in sustainable infrastructure.

And now this great city has made some pretty significant successes in the last several years. We did succeed in reducing [GHG emissions]. We had, of course, a goal of getting to 85% reduction by 2030. We did reduce emissions by 30%. That's a work in progress.

There's been a lot of good work done in the City:

- Converting 18,000 streetlights to LEDs
- Powering our wastewater treatment facility with renewable natural gas produced on-site [via biodigesters]
- Installing a solar array to help power water operations at the [Grand Rapids] Lake Michigan Filtration Plant.

All good stuff. So, we just want to keep it going. It's important that we work in partnership with our residents and employers to continue to identify effective ways to achieve our emissions reduction target goals.

C4 will definitely continue to work alongside partners in this process, but it's integral that we get this CAAP process approved [and] get into the implementation phase so that we can now utilize it as a roadmap for Grand Rapids to reduce greenhouse gas emissions and the impacts of climate change as the years continue. Notably, because we've seen so much progress just in the last few [years].

Of course, also, it goes on to impact everything from climate change to public health to ecosystems. And with such, of course, municipal infrastructure, which brings us here today.

This plan is vital because it helps mitigate the impacts of climate change, and it introduces a significant opportunity also for economic growth and job creation, something I don't think I've heard touched on too much, especially in the renewable energy and home weatherization sector, something that's growing more so than ever.

Especially here in Michigan- where we have so many concerns around lead. Especially in our housing stocks that are older than 1972. So much funding being earmarked for lead abatement and revitalizing our housing stock based on such, I figure why not look at it as a two and two: continue to work with our partners, work with our community members, [and] work with public officials like yourself in these next several years of the implementation phase of the CAAP.

But first things first, we got to get it approved. So, thank you.

#### Ivan Diaz, Resides in Grand Rapids

Good evening again, Ivan Diaz. I stay on the south side.

I wanted to say that I completely support the Grand Rapids Climate Action & Adaptation Plan. When I was still on the County Board of Commissioners, I was proud to vote in favor of transforming our system in the County. So that we can move away from landfilling and remove a lot of the waste, that could be recycled, into the economy from our County waste.

But the fact is, that I regret that that was not nearly enough of what could have been done at the County level. And the fact is that not enough is being done at the State or Federal level either. In fact, we have somebody in the White House who is not just a fascist, but who is really putting all of us in danger.

They're threatening to cut down our forests and do all kinds of terrible things. And unfortunately, that just means that more of the lift is going to be put on local government like yourselves. I watched the [April 15<sup>th</sup>, 2025] meeting from a couple of weeks ago, or whenever that was, when you all put this on the agenda for today.

I enjoyed seeing the robust discussion there, and I do agree that some of the things that are in this CAAP are things that will need systemic change before you can act on it, or they are things that are aspirational. But we need aspirational goals.

We need to do all we can because if we don't, if we continue doing what the past generations who were in power did, we're all going to be in danger.

We need to change the mindset. You know, one thing is to talk about systems, systems that need to change, but really we need to change the mindset of our neighbors, of our communities, the people who live here.

I used to live, my family still lives, by Clemente Park. If any of you drive up through the little curve that becomes Hall Street with a little behind that church: [it is] constantly full of trash, constantly, always, constantly.

So, we need to change the mindset: the attitude that people have towards the environment. Yes, you all need to change systems. Yes, you all should be advocating to the State and Federal level to change systems, but I'm looking forward to seeing each and every one of you, not just Commissioners and the Mayor, but staff also out in the community and telling people why it's that important to not throw stuff out the window when you're driving, why it's important to recycle when you can.

I hope to see ordinance changes in the future around composting. I mean, why not? That was one of the things that was brought up when I was a County Commissioner was, well, if we have too many bins out on the street, people aren't going to be people aren't going to know what to do with them. They're going to make stuff up.

I think you all can figure it out. I don't know about the people over who are in power over in the County, frankly, but I think the people here can figure it out. So, like I said, I'm looking forward to seeing you all in the community because it's going to take... I mean, mistakes from the past few decades got us here. It's not going to be an easy or a quick lift, but we need to do it because if we don't, we all know what's going to happen. Thank you.

# Kimmy Spring, Resides in Ward 2

Good evening, I'm Kimmy Spring. I live happily in Ward Two and I'm here just to speak as an individual. I think the work that the Department of Sustainability did with this process was very strong.

I worked with Jennifer Spiller on refining some of these things that people: the 1,100 or however many people had spoken about. And we, you know, put them in a categories. And really, she picked a very... strong and diverse group to put this all together in a way that makes it a very strong document. It's not perfect, [but] it's a living document [and] it will change. Also, we need to have a document in place. So, when there are, all of a sudden, opportunities taken away, or offered, by philanthropists and the State and Federal government, and Kent County as well, that we have a plan in place. And we look at it and go like, does this fall within the plan? Yes, let's go for it and not worry in advance when you look at the plan, [and go] "oh my god, how much is this going to cost? How much is this going to cost?"

It's going to cost a lot. but if you do a cost benefit analysis down the road, we will all have healthier communities with less pollution and better infrastructure and more equity, especially in terms of resiliency and affordable housing.

So, I don't want to drag things on. I just want to say it's not perfect, but please support the document and we'll work on tweaking as we go along. And the Grand Rapids Climate Coalition has many, many people in it now and we're all willing to help make this process work. Thank you and good evening.

# Cody Meyer, Resides in Ward 2

Hi there. I'll try to project since I'm pretty far away from this microphone. My name is Cody Meyer, and I live in the second ward. For the past seven years, I've worked as a Consulting Engineer in downtown Grand Rapids, specializing in retro-commissioning and monitoring-based commissioning. These are data driven processes that identify energy savings opportunities and buildings and essential, but missing piece, of the Climate Action & Adaptation Plan. My firm has completed 21 of these projects in schools, universities, multifamily buildings and uncovered about \$740,000 a year in annual savings. That's an average of \$35,000 per year per project, with simple paybacks under seven months.

Our energy conservation measures account for 4.6 million pounds of CO<sub>2</sub> saved every year, the equivalent of taking 435 cars off the road every year. So why isn't this standard practice? The barriers are awareness and funding.

Many of my clients work with ESCOs (energy service companies) who help provide these finance to and to implement these improvements. Some of them are utility backed and require minimal upfront costs. Others are use performance based models where repayment comes from energy savings. It's a proven business model that works even in underfunded school districts.

Now here's the opportunity. Grand Rapids can't mandate stricter energy standards than the State- that's laid out in the Climate Action & Adaptation Plan, but nothing stops us from facilitating funding. Why not partner with an ESCO or better yet, become our own municipal ESCO? A small investment in a retro-commissioning project could snowball into self-sustaining energy service fund that supports local businesses, creates jobs and reduces emissions.

This climate math adds up. So, it's time to act. And with that, I want to make one more comment about the contents of the CAAP. First of all, I want to say I'm sorry for not providing these comments earlier, but secondly, the CAAP rightly identifies that minority groups are disproportionately affected by climate change. But then what it also does is shift responsibility to act onto those communities.

These offerings that are made to these lower income communities are great. They financially benefit from those situations, but it does compel them to act in a capacity beyond their responsibility. These problems that we're facing are made by commercial activity and it should be the commercial responsibility. Thank you.

# Erica Bouldin, Resides in Grand Rapids

Hello. My name is Erica Bouldin and I am a resident of Grand Rapids. I'm a Climate Justice Organizer with The Urban Core Collective, and I'm a member of C4's leadership team.

I want to start by saying I wish I wasn't just here in big moments. I wish I could spend time attending Commission meetings, staying up to date on everything happening at the city level that will undoubtedly impact my life here in Grand Rapids. But like many of the folks here and listening online, we are working full time jobs while trying to maintain our lives outside, both of which are growing more difficult by the day

So, I am here as a voice for the individuals who cannot be here. This is something that's not only important to me, but it's important to the health and future of the city. Because yes, this is about our climate changing. But in order to address the impacts we face here, we have to talk about the direct environment we live in.

And just days ago, Grand Rapids was named 27th worst in the nation for ozone smog pollution, following trends from last year's American Lung Association State Of The Air Report. And because I think it's worth noting, one of [zip code] 49507's largest green

spaces is a cemetery. I can tell you right now that's not what the people want nor deserve.

We have to talk about action we can take right now to ensure a cleaner future for all, even if that means taking it small, just as every single one of you received all of the votes that got you into this position, every single step we take matters.

I appreciate each member of the Commission, some of which I consider to be friends. But we need you to collectively do better. We need you to stand on business, and we need for you to start with real, effective solutions, because our communities are in need of bold action and we're sick of being lied to.

I'm in full support of the Climate Action & Adaptation Plan, and although it is necessary, it's low hanging fruit. And if our Commissioners don't approve it, you're taking a clear stance against the environment and any solutions that will bring Grand Rapids closer to our goals as a State.

Not only should you be approving this, but you should be acting swiftly. And we know what it looks like when we act swiftly here in Grand Rapids. Just look at the amphitheater construction. With 114 million of our taxpayer dollars, you can do just about anything. We want to see that urgency and see that level of investment into the people, and not just into entertainment.

The continuum of unregulated behavior gladly encourages the greedy and money hungry corporations who ignore the signs of climate change for a bit of pocket change, and this is at the expense of the people.

So, Commission, we need for people like you to be prepared to take bold stance against the dangerous mindset of our current administration, because we don't just think, we know, that climate change is real. We know that right now, we can begin to turn the page and invest in sustainable practices across the city to help us get away from the impacts of climate change.

We know that now is the opportunity to bring green infrastructure, jobs, protected bike lanes, please god, protected bike lanes and better public transportation.

We know that there is a better way through, and that's why we dedicate our entire lives to this movement. Change is often incremental, and this is a necessary start. Thank you for your time.

#### Doug Ferguson, Resides in Ward 2

Good evening, Commissioners. My name is Doug Ferguson. I'm 25 and I'm a resident of Ward Two. I'm currently a Master of Public Administration Student at GVSU, and I'm here today to support the adoption of the Climate Action & Adaptation Plan. A new resident of Grand Rapids, my boyfriend and I moved to the area following his acceptance to the internal medicine residency at UofM Health West. We also live with my sister who is an experienced wetland ecologist.

I share this because in a time of talent competition, it's essential that Grand Rapids is able to attract a diverse young talent pool looking to invest in the city long term. I can assure you that top of mind for individuals my age is a climate crisis and what we are doing about it.

Part of being a competitive city means following science and addressing the threat that climate change poses. Prospective talent considers where they live very seriously and with a commitment such as the Climate Action & Adaptation Plan in place, Grand Rapids will reflect responsibility and safety to its citizens. More and more young adults cite climate change concerns as reasons to not pursue having children because we are afraid of what the planet we are going to leave behind looks like. This very real concern is a terrifying reality for our generations.

As for us, we are excited to put roots down in Grand Rapids and invest in our community. We see Grand Rapids commitment to responding to the climate crisis. The Climate Action & Adaptation Plan commits actions that help provide clear, clean water, air and food to our city and ensures that Grand Rapids will remain a safe, beautiful, equitable community for all.

So, thank you to all of the efforts that went into its creation. Thank you to the Commission for considering to support its adoption. And thank you especially to Commissioner Kilgore for showing this on your social media and always being an advocate for the happenings of the City on there. That's where I saw this. So, thank you, thank you.

# Josh Ferguson, Resides in Ward 2

Hi again. My name is Josh Ferguson and I'm from the second ward. I just want to, as someone who works in the climate space on a professional basis, the conversation

around renewable energy, around climate change is often a fraught one outside of the friendly confines of Grand Rapids and cities like it.

Passing measures such as the [Climate Action & Adaptation Plan] really helps be a lighthouse to the community communities around us and really help set the tone in such a way. As part of my day to day workings, I often go to rural townships where renewable energy plants are under consideration and one of the top concerns they have out there is *"why don't you guys do this in cities?"* 

And when we are able to lead, when we are able to be lighthouses on climate change where it is maybe more politically feasible to make those changes, it is really important that we do.

So, I highly support all of you voting "yes" on this plan but also, as you go forward into the budget process, funding these provisions as much as you possibly can so that we can move very, very quickly and so that we can start to see the fruits of this plan as quickly as humanly possible. Thank you very much.

#### Ally Beshouri, Resides in Ward 2

Good evening. My name is Ally Beshouri. I'm here as a resident who lives and works in Ward Two and is a Kent County Food Policy Council member. The Kent County Food Policy Council Advocates for and promotes a good food system in Kent County.

We applaud the development of the City of Grand Rapids Climate Action And Adaptation Plan. We believe the plan reflects community input and appropriately recommends tactics for achieving climate resilience and addresses widespread goals to address climate change.

The Kent County Food Policy Council developed a food system plan that was released in February of 2025. Our food system is a contributor to climate change and represents a massive area of opportunity in addressing the issues at hand.

Agriculture and farming, guiding food policy for local governments and institutions, food recovery and waste all represent areas of growth for Grand Rapids. The Climate Action & Adaptation Plan provides a framework for our collective action. We acknowledge the ambitious nature of such a plan and insist that we must start there in order to then develop specific action for application.

The Kent County Food Policy Council looks forward to working with the City's Sustainability Department to implement these recommendations set out in the Climate Action & Adaptation Plan. No one entity can solve climate change.

The City's Plan reflects the need to work collaboratively with strong coordination and tracking support from the Sustainability Department. We emphatically encourage the city of Grand Rapids pass the Climate Action & Adaptation Plan and begin the urgent and necessary work of tackling climate action and adaptation in our region.

Thank you for your time and for your public service.

# Kayla Snyder, Resides in Ward 2

Good evening. My name is Kayla Snyder. I am the Senior Programs Manager for The Michigan Green Building Collaborative: a strategic partner on the buildings and industry and transportation chapters of the Climate Action & Adaptation Plan.

Since our organization's letter was submitted and filed in the agenda packet, I will be speaking as a resident this evening. I live and work in ward two.

This is a critical moment. The effects of climate change are no longer distant. They're unfolding around us right now. If we do nothing. By the end of century, Michigan's climate is projected to resemble that of Kentucky. Additionally, we will see hotter, wetter, and more extreme weather.

We're already seeing the shift. In my own neighborhood in Creston my household, and many of my neighbors, have experienced destructive winds that toppled trees over the past two years. Just the other week, torrential rain brought water pouring through our basement window.

Severe weather causes panic, stress, financial burden, and often real destruction. As previously mentioned, climate change has even made me question whether my husband and I should bring children into this world. And I know that I am not alone in that fear. I want to raise a family in a place that chooses courage and progress, and cares deeply for future generations. I believe in our city's capacity to tackle these ambitious goals and foster a better future for all.

That is why I urge you to pass the proposed climate plan. It isn't just a document. It's an investment in public health, economic strength, and long-term resilience. It will reduce

emissions. It will save money through energy efficiency and support a growing clean energy job market.

Passing this plan sends a clear message that Grand Rapids is ready to rise to the moment to stand with more than 20 other cities in the state that have already passed and have robust climate or sustainability plans, and continue to be a City that acts, not just talks on climate.

There will be challenges. Again, as stated before, this plan is not perfect. No plan is. It was built with community collaboration and its success will depend on the same spirit of working together. We don't have every answer from day one, but we'll figure it out together.

Many elements of this plan, like the action item on benchmarking in commercial buildings that was mentioned in the previous meeting, will come before you again for further discussion. We can't let disagreement over a few details prevent us from moving forward with the broader vision.

We've got strong partnerships, we've researched best practices, and we are listening to community voices. As Commissioner Kilgore said so clearly in the last meeting, climate change is not stopping. Neither can we.

Thank you for your time, your leadership and your commitment to a greener, livable future.

# Nate Rauh Bieri, Resides in Ward 2

Good evening. My name is Nate Rauh-Bieri. I'm a resident of ward two. I'm also a volunteer leader in the Grand Rapids Climate Coalition. First of all, I'd like to thank Commissioners for supporting the Climate Action & Adaptation Plan proceeding to a hearing tonight. And I thank you in advance for your attention to all the community voices represented within the document and here in support. I'd like to add my support.

As a resident I'm excited about what's in the plan: multimodal transportation, healthier homes, walkable neighborhoods, kids no longer being poisoned by tailpipe emissions, clean electricity, food resilience, and the redress of historic and ongoing injustices.

This outlines the kind of community that I am, and will be, excited to live in and very importantly, not just people like me to be excited to live in. This plan was developed with

lots of input from frontline communities, low income, and communities of color- whose experiences differ from mine in significant ways.

My excitement about living in a place like that holds with national and global trends. Cities that have actual climate plans are more desirable places to live. <u>A report released</u> <u>late last year</u> found that: "there is a growing relationship between cities with strong climate resilience and mitigation plans and their potential to attract and retain investment, business and talent." The tracker found 76% of cities studied have welldeveloped climate strategy plans. Other studies support this, so I'm not alone in my excitement for such plans to be put in place and implemented while prioritizing equity.

We know, as others have said, and I want to echo their comments, that it's a community plan. It will take a community-wide effort working in collaboration across sectors. It's a roadmap, it's a guide, but the time is now to use momentum, a limited window of funding opportunities, and our collaboration to do all we can.

I hope you'll read the plan in all of its entirety, if you haven't. But in light of some concerns about who does what within it and the specificity of certain goals- I hope you'll pay attention, especially to page 96. It specifies the next steps to breaking down these goals and dividing up the work. And it sets a timeline for that in terms of gathering additional data and feasibility. If you want to see more specific goals or prioritization, please use that period and use that process but don't stop this momentum.

In the meantime, the quality-of-life concerns will continue to be addressed by people working at these intersections. It will set Grand Rapids up for a more just and resilient future. So, I, and many other community members, will be excited to help this plan succeed. Thank you.

[...]

# Will Gallmeyer, Resides in Ward 1

Good evening. My name is Will. I'm a first ward resident, Will Gallmeyer, and I'm here. I'm super excited about the CAAP. I'm a small business owner. I work in energy efficiency and electrification. And so, this is right up my alley.

I'm also a member of the Grand Rapids Climate Coalition. And what else do I do? Oh, I was one of the coauthors for the residential section [of the CAAP].

So, I just wanted to offer a few words about residential energy efficiency for electrification and how eminently achievable this is. A lot of my understanding of this topic and my work and my personal mission comes from *Electrify* by Saul Griffith.

I highly recommend this book, and in it, what he talks about is how approximately 85% of our carbon footprint problem in America is associated with the production, distribution, and end uses of energy. And so, what he outlines that we need to do in order to fix this is to, of course, clean the electrical grid, but at the end use section of this of this graph.

What we need to do is we need to electrify all the machines in our homes and the cars in our driveways. And the residential section of this problem is actually 42% of the problem. So, I'm very enthusiastic, obviously, about residential energy efficiency and electrification. And this statistic, I think really bears that out.

We have a huge opportunity to make our homes cleaner, have cleaner air, be more comfortable with heat pumps and drive electric vehicles. So, as it relates to air conditioning spaces with heat pumps, this is not some far-fetched crazy idea. This is a well-established technology.

The key is to deal with the envelope of the home, do air sealing and insulation first so that we have a reasonable heating and cooling load. And so yeah, that's pretty much all I wanted to say.

It's totally doable. You should vote for it. Thank you.

#### Kareem Scales, Resides in Ward 3

Good evening again. Kareem Scales of the Third Ward here today. In my second time around in the role of Board Co-Chair of C4, I want to do a quick just hand in the air anybody who is a C4 representative, Ambassador or has been engaged in any capacity with the CAAP, please raise your hand right now. And several folks have left and more on the line.

And so I really want to I'll speak really high level to this, but I want to speak to the first words of C4 and community collaboration. I've been around, in the city, for some time and been engaged in a number of advocacy fronts, and I have never seen a level of community engagement and collaboration that went into this plan. I want to

acknowledge Annabelle for all of her work and the office of sustainability and her predecessor, Alison Sutter, for planting the seed to get us here today.

And so, I hope that you all can take a look at the plan just as that as a seed that we can build upon. We understand that it is ambitious, but it needs to be. And I think what I would say is anything transformational doesn't didn't seem realistic in the beginning, but it takes the seeds and us to work together as a community to reach those ambitious goals.

And so with that said, I know it's not up for vote tonight, but we would ask that you all continue to support. Let's build upon the progress that has been made here. And thank you all this evening.

# Synia Jordan, Resides in Grand Rapids

Good evening. City Officials, Mayor, City Manager, I want to thank you for taking the time to listen to us tonight: our C4 team

I'm sorry, my name is Synia Jordan. I am a business owner on Grandville Avenue. I am a third generation here in the City of Grand Rapids. I'm a C4 member. I sit on the board along with my other colleagues here, who have spoke highly of the work we have done with C4, and I strongly support the work and the mission and hope that we can achieve our goals.

As a resident who was born into the First Ward- you know, we have dealt with a tremendous impacts of disinvestment and inequities. And I stand here before you today dealing with a lot of them.

And so, I am seeing this as an opportunity for change. I'm not I am grateful that, you know, we are looked at as one of the greatest places, not for black people though, but one of the greatest places to live. But I will say, you know, we want to advance and bring young talent, new talent here. But think about the people that are already here, think about the impacts and the things that we have been dealing with.

And so for me, this plan means real change for the people that have been boots on the ground, doing the work, living, working and investing in this community. So, think about us. Put some real dollars and thought behind this project. We have invested a lot of time. A lot of voices have been heard. A lot of energy has gone into this plan. And so, I ask that

you consider passing this plan so that we can begin to benefit and reap the benefits of this.

Thank you so much.

# Aaron Newman, Works in Grand Rapids

Hi there everybody. My name is Aaron Newman. I'm a building analyst professional with my own self-employed business. I came out here to voice support for the Climate Action & Adaptation Plan. I'm speaking as a paid professional or frequent volunteer for a lot of different GR based organizations with a focus on this particular line of work.

And particularly get to use my expertise towards average residents' property concerns from these measures, practices and technology. Climate and environmental action and justice impacts every City resident, and others in surrounding areas, especially frontline communities, who bear the brunt of decisions made for private gain rather than public good.

The Climate Action & Adaptation Plan outlines 197 steps the city can take. I urge this Commission to commit to supporting these actions and ensuring our most vulnerable communities aren't left to absorb the cost alone.

As ambitious as they may seem, it is well known that necessity drives innovation. A government that responds to the needs of its frontline residents and empowers their solutions, lays foundations for future cultural inclusivity and economic prosperity.

As a climate haven in a region experiencing promising population growth and city revenue projections, this city has both the opportunity, and moral responsibility, to lead. By implementing these measures, we can serve as an example for other cities, municipalities, and rural communities across Michigan. And demonstrate that these practices, technologies and policies empower residents to address their own problems with their solutions. Thank you.

# Shannon, Resides in Ward 3

Hi, my name is Shannon. I'm a resident of the Third Ward. I came here tonight to urge the City leadership to vote for the Climate Action & Adaptation Plan. Several people have

come up and mentioned how much it will cost and how ambitious it is, and I would like to argue that the plan is not ambitious enough- it does not do enough.

And that is not meant as a critique against the authors of the plan or the team that has worked endless hours. Because they had to focus on what was feasible, what the City could possibly afford, and balance that with what is actually needed: which is much, much more.

In fact, I would love to see what the Office of Sustainability and the rest of the team that came up with this plan could actually do if they could swap budgets with another department, such as the Police Department. If the City spent a third of its budget on sustainability rather than policing, I can't even imagine what we could accomplish.

We could do numerous green infrastructure projects. Possibly we could clean up some of the soil contamination along the [Grand] River, where numerous industries have existed and are now gone, but left their pollution. We maybe wouldn't even have to have yearly community cleanups to pick up all the trash that accumulates year after year. The possibilities are numerous, so obviously a plan that doesn't do enough and that isn't ambitious enough is still better than no plan at all.

So definitely vote for it. Support it. Pass it. Please, please, for the love of God, pass it. But then build on that and continue to do better.

Particularly Mayor LaGrand. You've ran on a campaign that included environmental justice, so please do not go back on your word and vote for this plan. Thank you for your time.

#### Wendy Randall, Works in Grand Rapids

Good evening, City Commissioners, Mayor, City Manager and staff. My name is Wendy Randall. I live in the City of Wyoming and I work throughout Kent County- particularly in the city of Grand Rapids.

I serve many roles throughout the community. Today I stand here as the Director of the Kent County Essential Needs Task Force. The Essential Needs Task Force (ENTF) brings together service organizations, and community advocates, to better understand root causes and address barriers our community members face in the transportation, energy, food, workforce, and digital inclusion systems.

The residents of the City of Grand Rapids who are served by our partner organizations have varied backgrounds and are doing all they can to get by. Many of these residents are experiencing multiple situations as byproducts of generations of environmental abuses and climate change.

I'm here this evening to express my enthusiastic support for the Climate Action & Adaptation Plan that was developed by the Office Of Sustainability through extensive community and expert engagement across many sectors, including the areas of focus of ENTF, we regularly hear in our discussions how residents of all ages are impacted by a lack of varied, sustainable transportation options by the age and inefficient quality of the built environment by limited options to advance our local agriculture, healthy food production and effective handling of food waste, and by slow investment in clean energy and clean environment jobs within the City.

The City of Grand Rapids has made great strides in openly discussing climate factors and piloting projects to gauge community interest. As a member of the C4 leadership team and a representative to the transportation and residential building work groups (T-CAT & R-CAT) of the CAAP, I was able to participate in multiple phases of the plan process.

The community has responded overwhelmingly to the engagement with a clear and loud voice, affirming the actions set forth in the CAAP and stepping forward to be part of the next steps. ENTF appreciates and applauds the leadership of the CAAP team and the partnership with community organizations throughout the plan development process. We passionately urge you to adopt the plan and move quickly into the prioritization and implementation phases.

We look forward to ongoing alignment and collaboration as we recognize that this ambitious plan will take support from all sectors and stakeholders. These are necessary steps for addressing climate change across our community through action and adaptation.

Thank you.

# Laura Sessa, Resides in Ward 2

Hello, my name is Laura Sessa. I am a Second Ward resident and relative to tonight's discussion, I'm also a scientist. I have been working in the field of biomedical research for over 15 years, so I am here today to voice my full support for the Climate Action &

Adaptation Plan, particularly the goals within which are based on science-backed targets. Particularly, as I understand it, relative to our share of what is has been agreed upon in the Paris Climate Agreement back in 2015.

These goals are what is necessary for us to reduce [GHG] emissions to roughly 50 to 60% of the 2019 levels by 2030. I also believe that these goals are achievable. There was some robust discussion at the previous Committee of the Whole meeting around if these goals are achievable and how we can require such ambitious targets if we don't think we can achieve them.

But I think that, quite frankly, a lot of what was shared at that was misinformation. And there was a lot of discussion tonight already about misinformation. So, I think it's relevant to address it.

As I said, these goals are achievable. The technology to achieve them in many cases already exists. For instance, electric heat pump furnaces reduce electricity use for heating by up to 75%, and they are up to 4.5 times more efficient than gas furnaces. These are these already exist. They're on the market today. You can buy them. They're better at dehumidifying the air.

Electric induction ranges and stoves provide better heat quality and better cooking than gas stoves and are safer. Heat pump dryers use 70% less energy than traditional dryers. And that's not to mention other technology like geothermal, solar, and wind energy, all of which are advancing remarkably quickly. And what we have today on the market is quite impressive.

One thing that I'd like to note, that is unavoidable as we address the climate crisis, that people are going to have to make sacrifices. This is just the nature of what it means to address the climate crisis that we're in. That means everyone, individuals and businesses alike, are going to have to feel some discomfort.

The goals that that are laid out in this plan, and in the Paris agreement, are focused on limiting global warming to less than 1.5° Celsius. And by many accounts, we may have already reached that point.

So, the time to act was ten years ago. The second-best time to act is now. I urge you to approve the plan. Thank you.

#### Mark, Resides in Grand Rapids

Mark back. That's not the point. This plan you're talking about is a good plan. But be leery of the funding because you might not get it. Because of the high jinks that the orange felon regime is doing.

I'm pretty leery of what's going to happen. In order to have this. I don't have the electricity and the and the clean energy that you need. The electric grids have to be upgraded to handle the electric stoves and everything else.

Again, like I said, once power goes out, you're at the mercy of the power company and it might take hours to get power restored. So, you got to think about that

But my worry is this. Lawrence County, Alabama, raw sewage, all over the Black community over there, you know, parents don't parents are afraid that their children, parents don't want their children playing out, they can't play outdoors due to the liquid waste and raw sewage that's all over the place. Because the orange felon basically dismantled the EPA, and there's nothing that they can do about it.

Or in cancer alley in Louisiana: where predominantly Black people are basically living where high toxic plants are basically putting cancer causing toxins in the air. Because once again, no EPA. So, you don't want that to happen here. I suggest you act fast and approve [the CAAP] because we don't want that coming over here to Grand Rapids or anywhere else in the state of Michigan.

Thank you.

# Steve Ashmead, Resides in Ward 3

Thank you for this opportunity to speak tonight. My name is Steve Ashmead. I live in the Third Ward. I'm a retired family physician, but I continue to teach at Michigan State University College of Human Medicine.

In my retirement, I have chosen to be a public health advocate through my participation in Michigan Clinicians for Climate Action, Citizen's Climate Lobby, and the Grand Rapids Climate Coalition. I believe the most critical issue that will impact the health and wellbeing of our citizens is climate, is the climate crisis.

We must begin the process of eliminating the burning of fossil fuels to provide energy to power our communities. Global warming and pollution are the direct consequences of

the continued combustion of fossil fuels. As mentioned previously, the American Lung Association, in their 2025 report gave Greater Grand Rapids, D and F grades for pollution here.

The goal for the CAAP appeared quite reasonable when initially introduced. These goals will be more difficult to achieve given the current Federal Government's resistance to continue the climate policies of the previous administration. However, the real threats of global warming have only become more apparent to those of us that are willing to look at the actual data. The health risks of our continued reliance on fossil fuels are numerous and discouraging. Relying on individuals to personally reduce their carbon footprint must be recognized as a strategy foisted on us by the fossil fuel companies.

The fossil fuel industry hopes to distract the public from their continued to desire to maximize their profits. It is critical that Grand Rapids continues to address these issues. The citizens of Grand Rapids, as evidenced by the presence our tonight, our presence tonight, requests that the City Commission find a mechanism to move forward with the CAAP that the Sustainability Office has diligently worked to create.

The Climate Action & Adaptation Plan, in collaboration with the Grand Rapids Community Master Plan, will help to create a healthy, equitable, affordable and sustainable community for all.

Thank you.

# Laura Hobson, Resides in Ward 3

Hi there. My name is Laura Hobson. I am a resident and musician in the Third Ward, and tonight I just want to read, for just one second, from a book. It's by poet laureate Joy Harjo, and she is a renowned performer and writer of the Muscogee Creek Nation. These are her words, not mine, and I think it gives a little context for how we've arrived where we are today. And I just think she says it very beautifully. Quote:

"We frequently sat in meetings with the power brokers whose decisions would decide the fate of peoples, waters and lands. It became obvious that there were separate realities of oppositional values and worldviews. As native peoples, we were up against those who believed that power and value lay in the acquisition of lands, fuels, and natural resources. They believed Earth to be a dead thing, meant only to be mined of anything that would bring money into the hands of the power players. Earth is a living being. We cannot own the Earth, rather, we are an essential part of the Earth.

Our relationship with the Earth will decide the fate of our families, our future generations. To dig, destroy, take more than you need, and to do so with the intent to benefit a few is considered disrespectful to all, and more than that, extremely dangerous.

The questions arise in me now as they did then. Why do we continue to have to battle for protection of our home, this Earth garden? Why do the destroyers appear to have the odds no matter which way we turn for justice?"

End quote.

I moved to the Third Ward nine years ago and bought the home simply because of the ancient oak tree on the lot. That might sound silly to you, but every day I am thankful to somebody I will never meet for planting that tree over 200 years ago.

And every day I thank strangers who used to rent the property and own the property and steward the land before me for not chopping that tree down. It brings so much joy to my neighbors, the children in my neighborhood.

Everybody who takes a walk by it says something about the tree, and I hope that 50, 100, 200 years from now, people can look back and be thankful to the people in this room who decided to approve the Climate Action & Adaptation Plan. Thank you.

# Sergio Cira-Reyes, Works in Grand Rapids

Hello, my name is Sergio Cira-Reyes. I'm the Climate Justice Catalyst at the Urban Core Collective. I lead the Environmental Justice Team there at the Urban Core Collective. And I'm here also as a board member of Community Collaboration on Climate Changewho was one of the stakeholders, along with the Urban Core Collective and other partners in doing some of the engagement for the Climate Action & Adaptation Plan in partnership with The Office of Sustainability.

And so, I'm here to express our support for the Climate Action & Adaptation Plan. We believe strongly that something needs to be done about climate change, on the equity front, because communities of color are first impacted by climate change and contribute the least.

Also, because of the adaptation component of the plan. That is that- if we look at how the City invests, not just the city, but for example, like, you know, how taxes are concentrated downtown, the influence that, you know, business has on the city.

If we rely on how the City allocates resources, currently, and we don't take a serious look at how adaptation is going to replicate those disparate impacts- then we're going to replicate those impacts going forward. And the City is going to continue investing disproportionately here downtown and businesses and affluent communities.

And I think the Climate Action & Adaptation Plan is an important tool for us to think critically and honestly about how we need to prepare for climate change going forward.

I went to the MI Healthy Climate Plan Conference recently and Hilary Dole, she's the Chief Growth and Marketing Officer At MEDC, cited multiple stats about climate change. They did a study together with MIT and talked to businesses and, in Michigan, 100%- she said that rarely they have 100% respondents on surveys, on studies- but 100% of businesses in Michigan have already been negatively impacted by climate change.

Also, 75% of those businesses they talked to, 75%, have considered relocating, due to climate change, out of Michigan. It's that conundrum because I know that, you know, the business community has expressed some concerns about the climate change.

You know, our mayor poked a lot of holes in it. Ran on climate change, but then when the Sustainability Director made the presentation, poked a lot of holes in it, that's true. But we can still work with that. And the climate plan could do a lot more than his electric vehicle could do in the long run.

#### Peter Scornia, Resides in Ward 3

Hello my name is Peter Scornia. I'm a resident of the Third Ward and a local builder and developer. As a builder and a developer, and I can't say I represent the real estate industry, but I'm concerned about cost. I'm concerned about how much does it cost to build. I'm concerned about how much does it cost to develop property.

What I'm really concerned about is, as a building owner: do people want to live here? That will hurt my business more than any.

And I and I refer to the gentleman here who, who, who lives here now in Grand Rapids. We need those people to want to stay in the City. I have been fortunate enough as a developer to build five buildings, a little over 100 apartments that are all electric. They've been in operation now for six years. I can say that they perform better than my previous experience with gas-fired buildings. They are equal or cheaper "first cost" to build. They are cheaper to operate and they're healthy-healthier for the people in our buildings.

I'm also proud to say that I'm working on three new developments with emerging developers in the City, that we're doing 50 new apartments that were in the planning or construction phase on right now.

I learned from a mentor about the idea of the triple bottom line: people, profit, planet. We have to keep these things in balance. It is not just about first cost. "First cost" is a factor. And in my experience, again, all electric buildings are equal or less for first cost. If people tell you otherwise, they haven't looked into it.

We have to be concerned about the planet, and we have to be concerned about the people that live in our in our community. Big problems create big opportunities. I think we have a tremendous opportunity here.

And I would add that data drives improvement. And I think one of the greatest things the CAAP program is doing is forcing us to get real data, really look at where is our where are our carbon emissions truly coming from, and how can we change them?

And I will end with a quote, one of my favorite quotes from Paul Wellstone: "*We all do better when we all do better*."

We can do better. And I think this is a really important step for making sure we do that.

Thank you.

# Brian DeVries, Resides in Ward 2

Hello, my name is Brian Devries. I'm a resident of the Second Ward, and I'm also a scientist working in the agricultural sector. I would like to express my support for the Climate Action & Adaptation Plan. Thank you to the Commissioners, City employees, volunteers, and the consultants for all their hard work on making this ambitious and well thought out and realistic plan to address the climate emergency.

There has been a lot of discussion about having realistic goals in this plan, and while it is obvious that we should not make obviously impossible goals, I worry that too many people are defining a realistic goal is only those things that do not require us to change our habits, or how much of a business's revenue should be spent on obtaining energy, or how seriously our government invests in neighborhoods that have previously been left out of beneficial development.

I am sure that when our residents look back at the performance of the City, and their elected officials, in a few years at later elections- I'm sure they will not ask: *did the City meet a set of easy, realistic climate goals that did not ultimately meet our needs?* But rather: *did the City's efforts meet the seriousness of the challenge set before us?* 

So, I urge you to adopt this excellent plan when given the opportunity. And show real leadership in climate policy.

Thank you.

# Jonathan Hand, Resides in Ward 3

Hello, my name is Jonathan Hand. I'm a resident of the Third Ward. I'm going to be talking to a few different perspectives tonight that I have. The first is as an energy expert. So I have a I have a PhD in Environmental Science. And I've been working in the climate mitigation space for my whole career: the past 15 years.

And I just want to say that from that perspective: I really appreciate that the plan is science-based. And I also believe that it is definitely technologically achievable. If we do not achieve it, it won't be because we don't have the technology to do so- it will be because we don't have the willpower to do so.

I also appreciate how data driven the plan is, like was previously said, and also that the plan acknowledges that this is a work in progress and we're going to continue to evaluate it every five years- in tandem with taking new greenhouse gas inventories.

I also want to support the plans that Grand Rapids is resident. It's really exciting to me that my hometown is doing this. I think it really signals our values. You know, after I grew up here and when I moved away, I realized that everyone says Grand Rapids is a is a great place to raise a family. And I can't think of a better way to signal to all of our residents that we care about families in the next generation than by passing this plan.

I also think it signals to businesses, actually, that we're on the forefront, and we see this as the future. And most of the leaders in this space at a national, international level,

regard climate change as the greatest wealth creation opportunity ever, because it's a huge crisis, but it's also a huge opportunity.

And this is going to require both white-collar and blue-collar jobs and lots of them. And, you know, it's going to just increase, I think, if we do this, business and revenue tax revenue for the City. And I also think it's passing this plan will signal from the City that it here's the residents that climate change is costing us money right now.

I also want to speak to this plan as a human being and a person of faith. I like that this plan is focused on equity and justice and how clear it is. The plan is involved with so many different communities, people from different backgrounds. And so, I believe that passing this plan is also the morally correct thing to do.

And lastly, I would just say as a Third Ward voter, you know, climate change is my number one priority. And so, Commissioner Perdue, Commissioner Kilgore, and Mayor LaGrand, like, I voted for you on this issue, and I hope that that you will vote yes.

And lastly, I just want to emphasize just again, I think this is very exciting that we're doing this and it's going to be difficult, but it's also very exciting. And we can take the bull by the horns, and I think we can accomplish it.

Thank you.

# Carlos Calderon, Resides in Ward 1

Good evening, Commission. My name is Carlos Calderon, resident of the first ward and the Director of Environmental Programs at the West Michigan Environmental Action Council. I stand before you today with a long-standing commitment to our City and region's environmental well-being.

My involvement as the current chair of the Urban Agriculture Committee, Vice Chair of The Stormwater Oversight Commission, a Member of the Grand Rapids Climate Coalition's Executive Committee, and a contributing voice, among many, in the creation of this plan, underscores my dedication. With a background in ecology and watershed management, my expertise lies in promoting sustainable practices and empowering our community through environmental education.

I believe that it is imperative for the City of Grand Rapids to continue its work on reducing our climate impacts and improve our resiliency in an ever changing world. The CAAP is more than just a document. It's a vital and holistic roadmap for safeguarding our community's well-being and economic vitality. By supporting its adoption, our elected officials and city staff will empower Grand Rapids to lead the way towards a sustainable future.

Building upon Grand Rapids history of resilience and adaptation planning over the past two decades, the CAAP represents a crucial next step. It synthesizes valuable insights and provides a pathway for the city to not only lead, but also effectively collaborate with key stakeholders across our community.

Not only does this affect our current residents, but West Michigan's potential as a climate haven presents both an opportunity and a responsibility.

This means we need to be implementing actions that continue the efforts of the last 20 plus years: such as supporting our Vital Streets Initiative. Which not only reduces harmful vehicle emissions but also enhances accessibility and promotes healthier transportation options for all residents, promoting nature based solutions, mitigating urban heat island effect, adapting our materials and waste management practices proactively to ensure we can sustainably accommodate a growing population and minimize our environmental footprint.

This plan should not be viewed as a burden to business and industry, but rather as an opportunity to foster local job creation, stimulate sustainable economic growth, and build resilience across all sectors of our community. It's paramount that the implementation of the CAAP prioritizes equity, ensuring that vulnerable communities are not disproportionately burdened.

It's time for decisive action now, and by embracing and implementing the CAAP, our City has the opportunity to demonstrate leadership in the region.

Thank you.

# Bill Knapp, Resides in Ward 1

Good evening. My name is Bill Knapp. I live in the First Ward, and it's like it's not urgent enough that we've got a climate crisis, now we've got opposing forces. EPA is being destructed, NOAA is being dismantled, funding for university research is being taken away. And I just learned tonight from Kristof that the Michigan Climate Corps has been defunded as of 9:46pm last night. So that has a direct impact on what the City and the Office of Sustainability is doing here, right in the city.

I support it completely. I think it's pretty obvious that this is just a road map, and you've got so much support from all of the community, from all of these community organizations. It's incredible to see all of these people come out and knowing and reading that the plan is all about bringing community and City together.

That you've got the city of Ann Arbor that passed, in 2022, a millage that brings in \$7 million a year to fund their sustainability plan. We could do that. I mean, there's a lot of people who go to the streets and get ballots or get petitions signed. I think there's a real, real avenue to success here.

And knowing that this is a road map. So, the adoption of a road map seems pretty straightforward. And I mean no disrespect, but it's a no brainer.

Thank you.

# Ali Frost, Resides in Ward 2

Good evening. My name is Ali Frost. I am a lifelong Grand Rapids resident and a citizen of the Second Ward. I also work in the First Ward. So, I work in the sustainable building industry. I commission buildings, I'll do energy audits, and I've even worked on other climate action plans for other communities. I've also formerly was involved in the solar energy industry. So, I have a lot of background in this kind of thing.

I'm here to express my support for the Climate Action & Adaptation Plan, but I also wanted to outline a few concerns that I had about it as well. So, I believe that having a climate action plan is completely necessary for the health and survival of our community. But I also worry about the implementation part of it.

Many of the measures outlined in the plan seem a little bit unspecific, a little bit vague to me. Some are phrased as just supporting a certain action, and I don't see any quantifiable goals for some of those actions or any projected timelines.

And I hope that those specifics are still to come. But I'd like to see a commitment to more specific and quantifiable goals sooner rather than later. All of the ideas are a good start, and I think that we're moving in the right direction with them. I love that there's a

focus on justice, for example, but I don't want the City to engage in any kind of greenwashing either.

I don't want us to have a plan where it looks like we're making progress, and then there's no consequences or actions for not meeting the goals, and there's no enforcement of those goals.

I also believe that it's important to coordinate with other parts of the City government, such as the building department (<u>Development Center</u>), and in developing this plan, when I was working in the solar industry, I noticed that there was some serious barriers to implementing solar within the city. There's a lot of zoning restrictions, even for like very basic solar projects. Sometimes we had to file for variances to get them approved.

There's a lot of issues with that, and especially a lot of people who were interested in implementing solar that came to us at the time were in historic districts, and that's just basically a no go at all. And yeah, so, you know, that is also definitely a barrier to implementing further energy measures within the city.

And, you know, of course it's good for the City itself to be implementing things, but it's nice to also empower the community to do so alongside them. So those are the main concerns that I was planning to outline here. So, I urge you to adopt the CAAP, but please consider refining it further so that concrete actions can be taken and enforced.

Thank you.

# Tom Tilma, Resides in Ward 3

Good evening. I'm Tom Tilma. I want to thank everybody who's made it possible for the Climate Action & Adaptation Plan to be brought this far. And I'm excited about the idea of the leadership role the City of Grand Rapids can play statewide and nationally when it comes to community-wide climate action.

Some have said, the previous speaker referred to this: this idea that the plan is too broad, it doesn't have the specificity. We would like to see the measurable outcomes.

But as a strategic planning document, I think it is outstanding.

It does appear that a number of follow up plans will be needed. I'd like to focus on the transportation sector, as some of you know, or all of us should know by now,

transportation is the single largest source of greenhouse gas emissions in the United States, and it's been that way for many years. So that's an important section of the plan.

The plan does call for a Pedestrian Action Plan, which is long overdue. I highly support that. But the plan also includes a number of quite dramatic changes to our cycling infrastructure, and I support those as well.

I am a supporter of the friends of Slow Streets Initiative, as well as the Bicycle Coalition and Strong Towns Grand Rapids, and that is a goal that they have that we would have a network of protected bike lanes.

However, it's hard to imagine putting that together, that type of initiative without updating the current *Bicycle Plan*. The current *Bicycle Action Plan* does not accommodate that kind of aggressive and far-reaching change to our cycling infrastructure.

So, I strongly encourage that you not only create a *Pedestrian Action Plan*, but that you also update the current *Bicycle Action Plan* and those efforts can be combined. The City of Chicago did complimentary bike and ped plans going on 15 years ago, so that's a customary thing for cities to do.

Last time the *Bike Plan* was prepared essentially by one staff person, and that staff person did an excellent job of going out and doing tabling at dozens and dozens of events. But we didn't have the kind of interaction that you see in terms of group decision making processes, like you see with the master plan update.

So really, this time around, to have the kind of far-reaching plan for pedestrian and bicycling that we really need, there really should be an inter-departmental staff team that leads it, working with the consultant and a citizen task force.

Members of the citizen task force could represent the Mobile GR board as well as the Vital Streets Commission, the Planning Commission, as well as advocates from the community who are members of those groups. I mentioned Friends of Slow Streets, The Bicycle Coalition, Strong Towns, Disability Advocates, West Michigan Trails, and that kind of thing.

And there are other agencies that could be part of the staff team, such as representatives from the Rapid and [Grand Valley] Metro Council and MDOT. Speaking of the [Grand Valley] Metro Council, the plan at this point does mention their trails plan:

the Regional Trails Plan, but perhaps a more relevant product from Metro Council that came out recently is their Transportation Demand Management Plan.

Transportation demand management is the idea that you reduce the demand for roads and road construction and road maintenance by directing people through a variety of means to use alternative modes of transportation.

[...]

Yep. So, the TDM plan does dovetail with the [CAAP].

So, thank you.

# Terry Gates, Resides in Kent County

Good evening, Commission and everyone. Thanks for sticking it out here. I'm Terry Gates I was born and raised in Grand Rapids by Riverside Park. So I had Riverside Park as my playground growing up.

I currently live in Alto, which makes me a Kent County resident, but I'm very passionate about what's happening in Grand Rapids because being a lifelong, you know, living here my whole life, it means a lot to me.

One of the things I want to notice is the council. So, Alicia Marie, with her degree in environmental science, and we've had a talk. Marshall Kilgore with WMEAC and we you know, we've talked and David LaGrand with I know you're very passionate about sustainability and we talked. And I know a lot of you are very passionate about the environment and care a lot and that means a lot to everybody here: is how much you care about Grand Rapids and the environment.

So one of the things that means a lot to me is that I helped start the Grand Rapids Climate Coalition back when I got involved in day one of the Biden Administration, I started Healthy Planet Strategies because I knew that based on what Barack Obama had said, is that there is no challenge that poses a greater threat to the future of humanity than climate change, than our environment.

And so, I took that on as a serious challenge and started Healthy Planet Strategies with the goal to build awareness that would lead to action. And it's been a four-year journey, and it's been a very passionate journey for me, and I've been extremely involved.

But one of the things that I noticed in the CAAP is some of the data that has been brought up. Today I was out for a run and I went past this electronic message board and it said current temperature 79 [degrees]. And I'm going like it's April, it's 79 degrees! So, I went and googled, what is the high average temperature for April 28th? And it's 57 degrees

So, in the CAAP they talked about how right now Grand Rapids is experiencing eight days a year over 90. And they're saying by mid-century we're going to have anywhere from 20 to 38 days a year over 90 degrees.

That's got to scare the hell out of us, is that the planet is warming and we got to do something about it. And when I take a tally of everybody that has spoken so far, I would say that it's pretty much in favor.

So, I know that I don't need to speak because everybody knows that we have to do something about it. So, given the current administration, federal dangerous inaction about climate, people are ready to step up and hundreds of people want to do something about it. And we need to allow them to mobilize the CAAP. And that's what I'm all about.

#### Oak, Resides in Ward 1

Hello, it's Oak from Ward One. Sorry. I'm tired, like probably everyone in this room, but that is actually a testimony to how important these kinds of things are. And leaning into that feeling can reconnect you with your body, which is why we're all here and why the CAAP is important.

Because money is not real. And what is customary can be changed. But this is what's real. For all of us. For everybody. And this is a good start. There were a lot of very experienced, intelligent people who spoke as to all the different reasons why this is really important, and I also do want to echo that.

I don't want to leave any part of our world, but here specifically our City behind, making sure that we do pay special care to people who are disproportionately affected by it. And making sure that when we are moving forward to try to repair the damage done that we extra pay attention there.

I'm going to cut it there because yeah.

#### Janet Zahn, Resides in Ward 1

Good evening. Echoing that, thanks for hanging in there with all of us who've also hung in here for the opportunity to add to the conversation. My name is Janet Zahn. I'm a resident of the First Ward and co-chair of the Grand Rapids Climate Coalition. Many Climate Coalition members have already spoken, and many other people who are not part of the Climate Coalition, but other groups, such as C4, and various other community citizens who have voiced probably everything that I would want to say.

So, I think what I'm going to do is just really reinforce and broad strokes some of this. What I really love about the CAAP is that the process of coming to this document was so inclusive and relied upon the expertise of our staff and of community members, and the interest and passion of people who live here in this community.

Everybody's had a chance to have a voice in this. And as you've seen tonight, there's broad support for it. Is it a perfect document? No. Can it be improved? Yes.

It is meant to be a map, not a law. So, the folks who have said, oh, I'm worried about being punished for this, it's like there's no punishment attached to this document. But it should be the floor and not the ceiling. 197 action items. Oh, that's a lot. Well, guess what, folks, if there was one thing that we needed to do to solve climate change, we would have already done it.

But it's so many different things and all of these things that are listed in this document are coming to us to invite the participation of our government by leading the way with good policy, good incentive, and leading with good behavior on your on their own.

It is saying business needs to be a part of this success, and it's saying individual behavior matters too. And so, what I really love is the inclusiveness of all of the aspects of our community in this document.

I love that it's founded in equity, and it is brought voices to the conversation who haven't prior been part of discussions about climate change and spoken and heard from them in ways that make sense to them.

What I really like about this, though, is that it asks us to expand our vision. And so rather than being a crabby firebrand, I want to end this with one of my favorite quotes as well. And this is from the author, Antoine De Saint-Exupéry. And it's an invitation to expand our vision of what's possible. *"If you want to build a ship, don't drum up the men and women to gather wood, divide the work and give orders. Instead, teach them to yearn for the vast and endless sea."* 

And I would say, the endless sea that we can yearn for is a clean, healthy and safe, hopeful future.

Thank you.

# John, Resides in Ward 3

Hi, I'm John. I wanted to discuss climate action. I also want to apologize for yelling at yelling at you guys so much. Because I have temper I have temper problems that relates to PTSD and it's very hard. And I want to do is encourage you to listen to your hearts. Right. But I'm sure it's hard when I'm yelling.

Related to climate- I think that the revolution starts in the soil. I want to encourage the City, to encourage community gardens and be more relaxed about sort of eco-friendly, biodiverse, gardens like I my property. I put wildflower seeds all over and last summer I was all excited because I wanted milkweed plants. And that's the only thing monarch butterflies eat and they plant their eggs. And so I went to Horrocks, and I was like can I buy milkweed? But I don't think they sell it. It's just it's a weed, but it's not really a weed.

So, but then they started growing in my front yard and like I was so excited. It's like, oh, I got five milkweeds. And then I had six and then I had seven. And I was so excited. in checking on them every day. I put up a sign that said: *pesticide-free bird and wildlife habitat*.

And then when I was away one day, the city came and mowed all my milkweed. I was so excited about my treasured plants. They mowed my evening primrose. They mowed my back rain garden, which is insane. All cut because of my chosen, wild free, Earth friendly space violates laws that prioritize wealth in the name of property values over wellness of the Earth.

So, here's me trying to do my climate thing. But, you know, I would harass almost in a bureaucratic way. So, I want to say that I don't know if it's a part of the plan or whatever, but I was thinking something about, we've got all these plans. One we can't think, all right, we've got this thing, and this is the only area where we're working on climate.

And two, perhaps to look at what might we want to dismantle, or undo, or where are we kind of holding on to older, archaic and, you know, what are the values that are expressed in our laws or whatever?

And there might to me, I think of some of these lawn mowing nuisance things. You know, if I worked there, I'd be like, let's get rid of all this stuff. Like let people write a note and say, I'm growing sunflowers or whatever, but thank you for listening.

And I'll talk to you later.

# Keith Nguyen, Resides in Ward 1

It's late. I'm Keith Nguyen, I'm a resident of the First Ward. I'm a founder of The Green Building Council and one of the authors of the LEED standard. The LEED standard was a consensus-based standard that included all the industries, builders, banks, everybody involved in the building industry

It was a consensus based standard. It was measurable, and it continues to evolve. And so you can really measure results and improvement

I'm in support of this Climate Action Plan, but I'm concerned that it's an aggressive plan. And this Council I heard the other night say we need to have this hearing. It's important. We need to move this forward. In fact, the city in 2021 said climate is a crisis, and I don't think we're moving ahead with this plan like this is a crisis.

You know, we need to engage everyone. And I heard from one developer here tonight, but I don't see others. I don't see bankers, I don't see all the people involved in implementing this stuff that are really important.

We had Van Andel Institute, the [Grand Rapids Art] Museum, Rockford Construction, a number of companies certified their buildings to LEED platinum standards. Many years ago, Grand Rapids was a leader in LEED certification. And where are we now?

I mean, there are very few projects. My firm, many of our projects are not in the State of Michigan. They're not in cities in Michigan. They're in other states that are thriving and really moving ahead aggressively with their green building initiatives.

This plan, 2030 district was established. In 2016. We were told that engagement with the zero cities project in 2017 was going to inform the development of [the] CAAP, and so here we are many years later, finally coming up with a plan.

And most of what's in the plan in terms of what happens. Most of the action items are we're going to engage with this group, we're going to do this, you know, we're going to engage with the utilities. But there's nothing measurable, nothing that holds us accountable.

And I don't know if, you know, you know, as Commissioners, the has a requirement to build to LEED standards. You have a million, \$100 million worth of buildings that aren't being built to those standards. You're spending \$250,000 on climate offsets that last one year that could go toward solar panels or other things.

So, we need to adopt this plan, but it needs to be measurable. It needs to be much more robust than it is.

# Daniel Schoonmaker, Works in Grand Rapids

Thanks. Hello. My name is Daniel Schoonmaker. I'm the Executive Director of Michigan Sustainable Business Forum. We're Grand Rapids based organization that works with businesses across the state to advance climate leadership, social justice, and the creation of circular economy.

I want to thank you for this opportunity to speak with you tonight. I also want to thank you for putting in such a long night. You certainly earn what modest pay they give you.

It was 12 years ago, this week, that I came before a different City Commission, along with two colleagues at my former employer, the West Michigan Environmental Action Council, and received a commendation for organizing 2,000 volunteers to sandbag the Grand River and save your wastewater treatment plant. And in return, you commissioned from us a Climate Resiliency Report. 12 years ago.

And if it's helpful to know in that time since, I've served as a subject matter expert for the Commissioning of your compost facility, co-founded of the 2030 district and I put together that recycling container in your hallway.

A wise man recently said that the most sustainable thing you can do is live in a city. And I agree with Mayor LaGrand's statements from the April 15<sup>th</sup> [2025] City Commission that the plan is before you is ambitious but necessary, and the City is not currently resourced to meet these objectives. And the plan, as written, is not bold enough.

But I also agree with what Mayor LaGrand said to our organization on March 31 [2025]: that in the current environment, we need to look to cities for leadership. So, I look

forward to seeing the leadership for the City Commission in the creation of an implementation plan that will meet these objectives head on.

Acknowledging that more work needs to be done, but it is overdue. I live here because I believe that Grand Rapids has the potential to be the best midsize city in the country. My organization is based here because at one time it was the most sustainable midsize city in the country. I don't honestly think we can say that today.

And if we look just by who has climate plans, Grand Rapids is five years behind Kalamazoo, ten years behind Holland, ten years behind Ann Arbor. And in five years it will be a generation behind these cities. And you can't tell me that Kalamazoo has some secret sauce that Grand Rapids does not.

So, I've also been told that businesses don't support this plan, and I haven't seen that. That's not my experience. And I can say in closing that while the plan has written, may not deliver the results we need and needs to improve, I can say with due certainty that if you do not pass the plan in May, you will be a laughingstock within the environmental community and the country.

And whereas you're currently going to things and heralded as leaders, what they will talk about is the City Commission worked with its community for three years and turned down the plan.

And if you want that to be the legacy of your Commission and your mayorship. Well, I won't even finish that because I know that's not what you want.

Thank you for your time.

#### Gloria Cook, Resides in Ward 2

Okay. Real quick, I'm Gloria Cook. I am with the second ward. I'm also with the Grand Rapids Climate Coalition. I agree with everybody that has said something. I'm not going to go over that.

What I want you to look at, though, is do we have a human right to clean air and clean water? And what can we do to get that here now?

So, when you're looking at this plan, look at it as a human right. It's not a legal right yet, but it is a human right. And look at it because this plan sets now. And it also sets up for in the future.

So, all I got to say, we have rights. Not legal yet, but we will.

# Kate Pillsbury, Resides in Ward 2

Hello and thank you for your patience. My name is Kate Pillsbury. I'm a resident of the second ward. I was hoping not to speak tonight, but I felt that I had unique perspective to offer.

I've lived in Grand Rapids for the last couple of years, but for the nine years preceding that, I was a resident of Plainfield township on the Grand River. I lived with my disabled partner in a very small home right on the bank of the Grand River, and every year, many times a year, we would have to gauge whether or not we were going to vacate our house due to erratic weather and flooding.

And I think we all know what happened in 2013, when the Grand River had its historic 100-year flood. But what doesn't seem to be common knowledge among Grand Rapids citizens is that three of the seven most historic crests of the Grand River have happened since 2013: one in 2018 and one in 2020.

So, in May of 2020, just after the pandemic, when the Sanford Dam was being washed away, we also had a storm in Grand Rapids and the flood waters rose around our house so that you couldn't even see land, except for across the River.

I could only access my house by kayak, and my dog didn't know where to go to the bathroom because there was no land.

And I think that climate change can be this sort of amorphous, hypothetical thing that feels like someone else's problem and some future day. But it's here now, and it affected us many times a year. It impacted our ability to work, it impacted our stress levels. And the thing about a river is it doesn't respect property lines or city lines.

And that 2013 flood cost Grand Rapids millions of dollars. And I just think even if we look at it from a purely fiscal standpoint: we aren't in a position where we can rely on the federal government to provide us with help when we need it. That seems to be contingent on the president's favor with our governor.

And I just think that in a city where housing is already extremely limited, we cannot afford to lose any more housing due to rising flood waters. And we also need to make sure we have systems in place to communicate with our citizens so that we can be prepared.

And for that reason, I urge you to consider passing this plan. If you can't pass it as it is. I understand the restrictions seem complicated. Please amend it and work to protect our climate. Thank you so much.

# Ron Valerius, Works in Grand Rapids

My name is Ron Valerius. I work with City Shore Real Estate. 45 years of experience and endorsed by Dave Ramsey. What I'm very, very concerned and don't hear a lot of anyone talking about what I'm going to bring up: And that is this, first of all, real estate values in your neighborhoods.

Now just use Alger heights- it's 350,000. A lot of people can't even buy an entry level home. This man who spoke earlier about developments, housing and all that. I have friends that live out of state, mandatory things that they have to put in their new homes. All what that does is increase the price.

We have an affordable issue today. Buyers cannot afford to purchase. So I caution you as a board that you make darn sure that these home buyers, builders, developers, sellers are not paying for this.

And it's not a benefit to them. One lady said they'll save money in utilities. That's somewhat true, but that's over 5-10 years.

# [...]

They'll increase the price by \$50,000. In exchange they'll save costs on utilities.

But, here's the problem. They go to the bank and qualify for a loan. They no longer qualify because the bank won't take the credit in the savings of the utility costs and now what? They can't qualify.

And you need to get more experts on your board. I'm sure none of you would have thought of getting a builder, a developer. You know, how does this impact the real estate industry? The Grand Rapids Real Estate Board is opposed because they understand people can't afford a house today.

And with this, unless you figure out a way to get around it, it's going to cost the buyer more in their mortgage payment. I just sold a house in Jenison, \$460,000, 1st time buyers, 6% down, \$4,300 a month. 30 years, five kids.

Mortgage payment, Alger Heights, between \$3,000 and \$3,500. This can cause a problem with mortgage payments and the ability to qualify.

So even though this is a great thing, I'm not opposed to it. Be careful who you charge it to.

Guess what? I'd buy a new car today, but over ten years I've been adding costs cost, cost, cost cost. Back then that wasn't an issue. Now it is an issue for me. I make less money. I got less sales.

#### Ned Andre, Resides in Ward 3

Ned Andre, resident of the Third Ward. This Climate Action & Adaptation Plan is right on time. Every city in America is one day, one week, one month, one year, one decade away from \$1 billion disaster.

Climate change is serious. If you look at the state of Michigan, we're at the end of tornado alley. We've had f0, f1, f2, and for the first time ever, f3 tornadoes have ripped through the state of Michigan.

So, it's an existential problem. I could go into all the details. This plan is a magnificent roadmap. It can be refined, it can be honed, but we want to get it on the books. We want to get it in the budget at some scale, and we want to make progress and we want to make forward progress.

And I was listening to some of the gentleman here talking about the City of Grand Rapids coming to his home and forcibly mowing his lawn? I've been in the same situation. I made a decision to let my backyard go natural, and my grass is longer than 12in and suddenly I've got nuisance complaint, nuisance complaint, nuisance complaint.

Praise God I was here tonight. The woman came out and said, hey, today's your last day to file an appeal on your special assessment. I have four special assessments.

I have a \$885 bill with the city of Grand Rapids to cut my grass in the backyard, and I went to court and I won my court case but somehow I still owe \$885 on a nuisance that a judge said doesn't exist.

So, there are real world implications at a very small level and a very large level. And I think we need to take this very serious.

And Mayor LaGrand, I really appreciate you letting that woman speak when she was out of turn and out of order, because as I heard Commissioner Perdue say, you know, that the third ward, with this change in voting precincts, will now have 665 people voting in one precinct.

Imagine, just for easy numbers today, that there were 100 speakers here tonight, not everybody in the room, but just the 100 people who spoke. And that one woman who, if you would have said, hey, you can't speak, you're in the wrong place at the wrong time.

And she said, hey, I took the bus to get down here and I'm never going to make it home. If I try to stay for the- you would have disenfranchised that woman.

And so, you didn't. I see your heart to enfranchise the people. Enfranchisement- It's about more than just voting. It's about climate action and adaptation. It's about addressing the full and the holistic entirety of our lives here in the City of Grand Rapids.

So please, this is very important. It's existential.

Thank you.

# **Comments by City Leadership**

# Mayor LaGrand

I'd like to know what others think as far as the Climate Action Plan. It is a 100-page document. It's two years in the creation. I think there were lots of comments tonight about ways that it can be sharpened and improved, and I think that's really important, and I'd love to be able to continue to engage. And while, you know, many people have pointed out that climate change is a crisis, it's also true that this is something we want to get right. So, I would prefer that we take time... on this so that we can all grapple with focusing this plan and making sure that it's as successful as possible. Because I think generally, my sentiment is [that] the Commission wants to make this a plan that we can get behind and that will be successful.

# Commissioner Ysasi (2<sup>nd</sup> Ward)

I would be supportive of a work session. I think there are a number of pieces... like the bicycle [action] plan. I had some questions. Not so much of our plan, but I had a chance to talk to some folks from the that had come presented to the [Kent County] Food Policy

<u>Council</u> about some of the stuff that's happening even independently with our entrepreneurial ecosystem.

And so, I think for me, it would be helpful to [know] what is the City's purview? What are the legislative pieces? Also, if we can sort of compare it to our legislative agenda- I think [that] would also be really important too. How do we also uplift that?

So, I would be supportive of it, I think... balancing what we heard [tonight]... and we want to act swiftly. And I think we all do want to act swiftly. We also know that this project took many, many hands and many years. And so, you know, what does that work look [like]? Especially things like we're going to look at zoning or those sorts of pieces. So, I would be supportive of a work session.

#### Mayor LaGrand

We're about to enter budget season, which is going to be very intense for all of us. So, I think by implication, I'm suggesting that we have a work session after we're done with our budget process.

#### Commissioner Perdue (3<sup>rd</sup> Ward)

I am not interested in doing a work session on this plan. I'm interested in moving it forward. There's been a lot of work done. No plan is perfect. A lot of the particulars will be worked out as we go.

When we were briefed on this, I also shared [that] I want to have an idea of what's policy, what's budget, what's programmatic, what's administrative. And I still want that. I don't think that's an impediment to move this forward at this point.

I think it's time better spent to continue with our plan. And then after we get through budget season, after we have adopted this, then have a deeper discussion about where do we prioritize? Our work in the short term, etcetera, etcetera. So, I'm not interested in doing a work plan on this, and I'm interested in moving it forward as scheduled on the 13th of May.

# Commissioner Robbins (1<sup>st</sup> Ward)

I would be in the camp of wanting to take a step back. I think, like you mentioned, this is a long document. I still have some questions around, as was mentioned tonight, [the] cost of housing. I think it's always tough when we have a public hearing on one thingtwo weeks later we have a public hearing on another. And both seem to have, you know, competing urgencies. And so, I really want to think through the implications of that and how that's going to impact our ability to continue to supply housing in the community.

I, you know, just as much as anyone want Grand Rapids to be the healthiest, cleanest City around. But I want to do it, as was mentioned, through more specific, measurable, realistic goals. And then ultimately to just balance with all these other priorities we're talking through with housing, with other overlapping plans that my other colleague mentioned too.

#### Commissioner Knight (2<sup>nd</sup> Ward)

I guess I'm kind of in the middle on this one. I'm for moving it forward. I thought the conversation that we had last time when this was presented was that... as we get into our work sessions later this fall, that we would begin to talk about actual implementation, what things can be implemented, what things can we work on, what's actionable now, [and] how we plan that stuff out?

So, I'm not really sure... if waiting to do that is what happens. Or we adopt it and then start working on it because nothing's going to happen if we adopt it right now. We do have to think about... what are the things that can be added to our legislative agenda. And none of it's going to go into the budget if we adopt it right now anyway, because we haven't formalized what things that we can actually do and what can be implemented and how that's going to be implemented and what the timeline looks like.

# Commissioner Kilgore (3rd Ward)

I'm concerned here because I'm hearing varying perspectives on supporting the plan, not supporting the plan. I think that my biggest concern is that we are not kicking the can too far down the line. So, my direct ask here is to have transparency for the public of what the timeline is.

So, if we are going... after the budget season, are you proposing June? Which meeting would be? Would this work session be with [or] for the public? Because that would be a public meeting. And then when are we now proposing to vote? I think those two dates are very important.

I can see the clear need with the Commission for further conversation. And there were also "next steps" listed from the Office of Sustainability, which I feel like could be more and we can be more informed on with that work session. Such as sequencing of [the actions into] what's now, what's mid-term, what's long term. I think hopefully we'd have more feedback from the Office [of Sustainability] at the work session. But once again, my real ask here is to make sure the public, the experts, community members and organizations, and thousands of folks who have helped inform this Plan over [the] years aren't feeling like we're scrapping the Plan or we want to not have action. So, I'm asking for a clear timeline on both our work session and the new proposed date for adoption. ...

I am in support of a work session. But I need to I believe we it is imperative that we communicate with the community that this is an adjustment. And we are going to come back to this in a timely manner, and... the objective here is to vote on this- is to pass.

In my opinion, I'm coming to a work session to delve into some of the misinformation, delve into some of the, you know, fears that folks may have about this plan so that we can then vote on it. I'm supporting this but [want a] clear timeline. So yes, for the work session, but hopefully the next step after that is dates for the public.

# Commissioner Belchak (1<sup>st</sup> Ward)

I would definitely support a work session. I think that there's some meaty conversations. I think some of the clarity and refinement points that were brought up by some of the people speaking today are worth it.

And it took me four hours, 4.5 hours, to read all 100 pages and I would there were there were parts I didn't feel like I got as in depth on. So, that would be good to have more time.

Also, I have a question about like if there's just like nitty gritty, lots and lots of little typos... how do I go about offering those changes to make sure it's a final draft for real?

# City Manager Washington

So, we'll bring it back on the 13th and have an initial discussion of some of the feedback for the work session... We're going to bring the item back. The staff will brief, we'll have a work session, and we'll get direction from the Commission on the 13th on [the] next steps [for the CAAP].

# **End of Public Hearing**